Б. Абдилхаким[1]
[1]Нұр-Мүбарак Египет ислам мәдениеті университеті, Алматы, Қазақстан
e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com

МОДЕРНИЗМ ЖӘНЕ ДІН: ҮНДІСТАНДАҒЫ ТАРИХИ-ФИЛОСОФИЯЛЫҚ ІЗДЕНІСТЕР

Аңдатпа

Бұл зерттеуде XIX ғасырдағы Үндістандағы мұсылман зиялыларының діни-модернистік ой-пікірлері қарастырылады. XIX ғасырдың ортасында Үндістандағы саяси және тарихи өзгерістер мұсылмандардың өзіндік реакциясын туындатты. Осы аяда үш негізгі бағыт қалыптасты: біріншісі өткен шақтағы мұсылмандық үстемдікті аңсап, діни дәстүрді күшейтуді ұсынды; екіншісі сопылық және мессиандыққа бет бұрды; үшіншісі – модернистер – исламды жаңа дәуірмен үйлестіруге ұмтылды. Модернистердің басты мақсаты дінді заманауи ғылым мен рационалды ойлау аясында қайта түсіндіру болды. Бұл бағыттың негізін қалағандар қатарында Сәйіт Ахмет Хан, Жамалуддин Афғани, Шибли Нумани сынды тұлғалар бар. Мақалада олардың Құранды тұрақты және өтпелі үкімдерге бөліп қарастыруы, хадистерге қатысты скептикалық ұстанымдары және исламды жаңа герменевтикалық тәсілдер арқылы қайта пайымдауға ұмтылыстары талданады. Сондай-ақ Шах Уәлиулланың реформаторлық идеялары мен Батыс ғылымының ықпалы үнді мұсылман модернизмінің басты факторлары ретінде қарастырылады. Қорытындысында діни модернизмнің мәні исламды тарихи тұрғыдан қайта түсіндіру, оның негізін уақыт талабына бейімдеу қажеттілігінен туындағаны айқындалады.

Түйін сөздер: модернизм, дін, Үндістан, ислам, Сәйіт Ахмет Хан, шариғат.

B. Abdilkhakim[1]
[1]Nur-Mubarak Egyptian University of Islamic Culture, Almaty, Kazakhstan
e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com

MODERNISM AND RELIGION: HISTORICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL INQUIRIES IN INDIA

Abstract

This paper examines the development of Islamic modernism in 19th-century India and its ideological foundations. The political and historical transformations of the mid-19th century evoked various reactions among Indian Muslims. Three trends are identified: nostalgia for past greatness and a call for the revival of Islamic traditions, an appeal to mystical and messianic practices, and a modernist trend aimed at a rational understanding of religion and its adaptation to modernity. Modernists sought to reconcile Islam with science and progress, interpreting religious precepts in light of new conditions. Key representatives of the trend include Sayyid Ahmad Khan, Jamal ad-Din Afghani, Shibli Numani, Muhammad Iqbal, and

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NMU
NUR·MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

157
№3 (07) 2025

other thinkers. Particular attention is paid to the division of Quranic precepts into permanent and temporary, their hermeneutic interpretation, and the critical attitude of some modernists to the hadith. The reformist views of Shah Waliullah Dahlawi and the influence of Western science played an important role in the formation of ideas. In general, Islamic modernism in India is seen as an intellectual movement that arose under the conditions of colonial pressure and religious diversity, the main goal of which was to preserve the identity of the Muslim community while integrating with modern knowledge and culture.

Kew words: modernism, religion, India, Islam, Sayyid Ahmad Khan, sharia.

ب. عبد الحكيم[1]

جامعة نور مبارك للثقافة الإسلامية في مصر، ألماتي، كازاخستان

e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com

الحداثة والدين: البحث التاريخي والفلسفي في الهند

ملخص. تتناول هذه الدراسة الأفكار الدينية الحداثية للمفكرين المسلمين في الهند خلال القرن التاسع عشر. حيث أحدثت التغيرات السياسية والتاريخية في منتصف القرن التاسع عشر في الهند استجابة ذاتية من قبل المسلمين. في هذا السياق، تشكلت ثلاثة اتجاهات رئيسية: الأول دعا إلى تعزيز التقاليد الدينية والحنين إلى هيمنة المسلمين السابقة؛ والاتجاه الثاني اتجه نحو التصوف والمسيحانية؛ أما الثالث – الحداثيون – فسعوا إلى التوفيق بين الإسلام والعصر الجديد. كان الهدف الرئيسي للحداثيين هو إعادة تفسير الدين في إطار العلوم العصرية والتفكير العقلاني. ومن بين الشخصيات التي وضعت أساس هذا الاتجاه سيد أحمد خان، وجمال الدين الأفغاني، وشبلي النعماني. تحلل المقالة منهجهم في تقسيم أحكام القرآن إلى أحكام ثابتة ومتغيرة، وموقفهم المتشكك تجاه الأحاديث النبوية، وسعيهم إلى إعادة تفسير الإسلام من خلال منهجيات تفسيرية جديدة. كما يتم النظر في أفكار ولي الله الإصلاحية وتأثير العلم الغربي كعوامل رئيسية في الحداثة الإسلامية الهندية. في الختام، يُؤكد أن جوهر الحداثة الدينية ينبع من إعادة تفسير الإسلام في سياقه التاريخي، والضرورة الملحة لتكييف أساسه مع متطلبات الزمن.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الحداثة، الدين، الهند، الإسلام، سيد أحمد خان، الشريعة.

Б. Абдилхаким[1]

[1]Египетский университет исламской культуры Нур-Мубарак,
Алматы, Казахстан,
e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com

МОДЕРНИЗМ И РЕЛИГИЯ: ИСТОРИКО-ФИЛОСОФСКИЕ ИСКАНИЯ В ИНДИИ

Аннотация

В данной работе рассматривается становление исламского модернизма в Индии XIX века и его идейные основы. Политико-исторические трансформации середины XIX века вызывали у индийских мусульман различные реакции. Выделяются три на-

158
№3 (07) 2025

NYU NUR-MUBARAK UNIVERSITY

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

правления: ностальгия по прошлому величию и призыв к возрождению исламских традиций, обращение к мистическим и мессианским практикам, а также модернистское течение, нацеленное на рациональное осмысление религии и её адаптацию к современности. Модернисты стремились примирить ислам с наукой и прогрессом, интерпретируя религиозные предписания в свете новых условий. Среди ключевых представителей течения – Сайид Ахмад Хан, Джамал ад-Дин Афгани, Шибли Нумани, Мухаммад Икбал и другие мыслители. Особое внимание уделяется разделению коранических предписаний на постоянные и временные, их герменевтическому толкованию, а также критическому отношению части модернистов к хадисам. Важную роль в формировании идей сыграли реформаторские взгляды Шаха Валиуллы и воздействие западной науки. В целом исламский модернизм Индии рассматривается как интеллектуальное движение, возникшее в условиях колониального давления и религиозного многообразия, главной целью которого стало сохранение идентичности мусульманской общины при одновременной интеграции с современными знаниями и культурой.

Ключевые слова: модернизм, религия, Индия, ислам, Сайид Ахмад Хан, шариат.

Introduction

Indian Muslims in the mid-19th century reacted to the political and historical situation in India in three ways. The first yearned for the past era of Muslim world domination and felt the need to be close to history. They argued that in order to regain the power of the early centuries of Islam, it was necessary to revive Islamic teachings and spread religious values. The second group turned to messianic and Sufi paths to forget the bitter feelings of defeat. The third group, the intellectual Muslims, did not approve of either of the above trends. They believed that the Muslim community needed a new intellectual transformation. They tried to rationally analyze their era in order to demonstrate the relevance of Islam to the new era. The modernists set themselves two tasks: first, to identify religious aspects that represented progress, and second, to form a new understanding of real life based on rational thinking and a scientific assessment of the present. Of course, all this should not contradict the foundations of Islam. The main representatives of

this trend are: Sayyid Ahmed Khan (1817-1898), Jamaluddin Afghani (1837-1897), Chirag Ali (1844-1895), Shibli Numani (1857-1914), Maulana Khali (1837-1924), Sayyid Amer Ali (1849-1928), Muhammad Iqbal (1876-1938), Abul Kalam Azad (1888-1958), etc. In general, it can be said that three factors contributed to the formation of Islamic modernism in the Indian subcontinent: the Mu'tazila school, the reformist ideas of Shah Waliullah Dahlawi, and the scientific advancement of the West [Kamal, 2018: 480].

Although religious modernism in India gained particular momentum from the mid–19th century onwards, the movement has its roots in the 18th century scholar and thinker Shah Waliullah Dahlawi (1702-1767) [Britannica, 2024]. Islamic modernism in the Indian subcontinent occupies a special place in history due to its unique character and dynamism. There are several reasons for this. For example, Indian Muslims were among the first in the Islamic world to be exposed to Western science and culture

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NMU
NUR·MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

159
№3 (07) 2025

through Great Britain, which was then the most developed country in the world. It is clear that the British influenced the scientific pragmatism and pragmatism that are particularly noticeable in Indian modernists. Moreover, although India was ruled by Muslims for centuries, Indian Muslims always formed a minority alongside religious beliefs such as Hinduism and Jainism. Moreover, Indian Muslims and Hindus shared the same language and ethnicity, and it was not difficult for them to influence each other due to the similarity of culture and daily customs [Özcan, 2004: 197]. In order not to be absorbed into these groups and to preserve their religious identity, Indian Muslims always needed to be active and vigilant. In turn, they tried to show special religious zeal even during the period of British colonialism.

Justification of the choice of the topic and goals and objectives

The main reason for choosing the topic of study is the relevance of the interaction between religion and modernization processes in modern society. In the era of globalization, religion is not only a spiritual and cultural phenomenon, but also an important factor in social, political and civilizational relations. From this point of view, the study of the religious and reformist ideas of Islamic thinkers in India allows us to understand the internal evolution of Islamic civilization, as well as the ways in which it adapted to new historical conditions. In particular, the views of Sayyid Ahmed Khan, based on the combination of Sharia and modern knowledge, are considered an important

intellectual phenomenon that determined the period of revival of Muslim society.

The main goal of the study is to analyze the positions of Islamic thinkers on modernism and determine their influence in the religious, ideological and socio-political spheres. In accordance with this goal, the research work is aimed at revealing the historical foundations of religious and reform movements in India, systematizing the religious and philosophical concepts of Sayyid Ahmed Khan, identifying the features of the interaction of modernization and Islamic values, and evaluating the results obtained in the context of modern religious and social trends.

Scientific research methodology

This research work is based on the methods of historical-hermeneutic and comparative analysis. The historical method allows us to reveal the socio-political and cultural context of the era in which the views of Islamic thinkers were formed. The hermeneutic approach is aimed at analyzing the content of Sayyid Akhmet Khan's works from a religious and philosophical perspective, identifying their underlying meaning and ideological foundations.

The comparative analysis method was used to compare reformist ideas in Islam with the general theoretical concepts of modernism and to connect religious and ideological trends in India with similar phenomena in other Muslim countries. In addition, the structural-functional approach was used to assess the social role of reformist ideas in Muslim society, their impact on educational, legal and cultural systems.

160
№3 (07) 2025

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

The qualitative analysis method was also used in the course of the study, and textual sources, historical documents and Islamic works were scientifically interpreted. These methodological approaches ensure the validity of the theoretical conclusions and practical conclusions of the work.

Main Body

Indian modernists sought to resolve the contradictions between reason and faith, religion and science intellectually. To this end, religion was reduced to a set of ethical values that distinguished between good and evil. Both modernists and traditional scholars accepted the idea of a return to the basics of Islam. However, views were divided on the question of what the basics of Islam were and how to return to them. Modernists believed that the Quran was the foundation of Islam, and that returning to the basics was measured by returning to the Quran. Modernist thinkers divided the Quranic rulings into two categories: permanent and temporary. The former were binding on all believers, while the latter were not. In their view, the obligatory rulings of the Quran included the unity of God, his attributes, prophethood, revelation, God's creation of the world from nothing, and divine rewards and punishments, and these were fundamental aspects of religion. All Muslims must accept them. The temporary rulings of the Quran included certain social conditions and rituals that were described in relation to the Arab culture of the 7th century. The validity of these rulings is limited to the society of that time, and therefore they are not rules that must be followed by the

entire society at all times. The meaning of these rulings is determined by the historical context. Having divided the rulings of the Quran into permanent and temporary, the modernists sought to form a new hermeneutics for its interpretation. For example, Sayyid Ahmed Khan named the fifteen permanent rulings of the Quran as the basis of the new hermeneutics. The modernists believed that the issue of «returning to the basics» of religious faith was of historical importance, without which religious reform would not be possible. They believed that returning to the basics would purify religious faith from all that was not fundamental, which had been added to it by scholars and commentators. It was also argued that the involvement of religious scholars in matters unrelated to the foundation of Islam gave rise to many religious traditions, which led Muslims to distance themselves from the essence of religion and engage in matters unrelated to religious belief, thus increasing the ceremonial aspect of religious rulings and making them difficult for ordinary Muslims to follow. In turn, the leading modernist scholar and jurist, Sayyid Amer Ali, openly criticized the ulama class and held them responsible for the above situation. He also considered religious scholars to play an important role in interpreting Islam for the interests of political power and their own material benefits. Indian modernists themselves were criticized by traditional religious scholars for considering the verses of the Quran separately and giving different interpretations. Because in this case, different scholars would have different interpretations of the same verse.

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NMU
NUR·MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

161
№3 (07) 2025

In the matter of hadith, a section of Indian Jadidists were skeptical of the hadith and sunnah of the Prophet. It would not be an exaggeration to say that they considered it an element imposed on religion later. Therefore, they considered abandoning the hadith of the Prophet to be a logical consequence of returning to the «basics» [Kamal, 2018, 482]. In this sense, their closeness to the Quranists can be seen. However, on the other hand, Jadidists also tried to reconsider the hadith of the Prophet. Because although the hadith was not the foundation of religion for them, it was considered by ordinary Muslims as the second pillar of religion after the Quran. Accordingly, they had to reckon with this fact.

Among Indian intellectuals, the suppression of intellectual sciences such as philosophy in the Islamic world was also discussed. Muhsin al-Mulk (1837-1907), a prominent representative of the Aligarh School and a close associate of Sayyid Ahmad Khan, argued that in the Middle Ages, when religion and philosophy came into conflict, the latter would retreat or be suppressed by force. He argued that the situation had changed in the modern era, and that science had transcended its boundaries and become a pragmatic system based on evidence and experience. He also argued that no amount of pressure or intimidation could dampen its momentum, and that modern science had refuted all traditional concepts of religion. Muhsin al-Mulk therefore believed that there were only two options for religion today: either to let religion «die naturally» or to reinterpret it in the light of new knowledge and science [Ahmad, 1967, 112].

After a general overview of the ideas of Indian modernists, let us now turn to the Jadidist path and views of Sayyid Ahmed Khan, one of the founders and prominent representatives of this movement. Because his religious views had a great influence on his contemporaries and later scholars. Coming from a noble family, Sayyid Ahmed Khan served in the East India Company from 1839. Perhaps because he had been dealing with the British since his youth, we see that he was loyal to the British authorities for most of his life and treated them with respect. That is why he fully supported the British during the 1857 uprising. Sayyid Ahmed Khan devoted most of his life to enlightenment and was engaged in the issue of education among Muslims from 1859 until his death in 1898.

It can be said that Sayyid Ahmed Khan's cooperation with Britain was based on rational reasons based on self-interest. In this way, he tried to soften the British government's policy towards the local population. He achieved this goal to a certain extent in the 1870s.

He believed that there was no need for Indian Muslims to oppose British rule as long as they were free to practice and propagate their religion. He believed that even if another Muslim country invaded India, it should not be helped. However, he avoided directly answering the controversial question of whether India was Dar al-Islam (the land of Islam) or Dar al-Harb (the land of non-Muslims) [Ahmad, 1967, 33]. He seems to have been skeptical about the religious basis of both concepts. For example, in his book «Review on Dr

162
№3 (07) 2025

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

Hunter's Indian Musulmans», written in response to the work of an Englishman named Dr. Hunter, he argued that the concepts of Dar al-Harb (the land of non-Muslims) and Dar al-Islam (the land of Islam) do not appear in the Quran and authentic hadiths. Because Dr. Hunter wrote in his book that Muslims were obligated to wage jihad against the British in accordance with their beliefs. Sayyid Ahmed Khan opposed this idea and wrote that jihad was not obligatory as long as a Muslim's faith, property, security, and right to freedom of worship were protected (even if Muslims were not in power) [Khan, 1972, 38-40].

Sayyid Ahmed Khan believed that politics should be separate from religion. In his opinion, Muslims have never conducted politics based on revelation in history. The Prophet Muhammad himself made decisions on various worldly issues after consulting his companions. In other words, both the Quran and the Hadith left Muslims with great freedom in making policies [Öz, 1989:74]. He believed that Muslims needed three things to overcome the current difficult situation: 1. Adopt Western science and education systems and create a new educational center on the European model; 2. Provide a rational interpretation of religion and holy books in an era full of changes; 3. Try to bring the rulers and Muslims closer together [Özkan, 2003: 150]. Sayyid Ahmed Khan, who was not a supporter of political Islam, did not support pan-Islamism, and even considered it a dangerous political trend. Instead, he advocated the preservation of the status quo in India, and over time he became an active supporter of British

rule in India. Sayyid Ahmed Khan even called the British government in India «the most wonderful thing that has ever happened in the world». He praised the king's rule and thanked him for bringing civilization to India [Speeches and Addresses, 1898, 24].

In 1884, Sayyid Ahmed Khan proposed a political project of a tripartite alliance consisting of Indians, Muslims, and British. Because, in his opinion, peace would not prevail if only Indians or Muslims ruled the country, it was very important for another nation to establish power in the Indian subcontinent. He also believed that the peace that the British were enjoying should be taken advantage of. Sayyid Ahmed Khan supported the Turks in cases where it did not conflict with British interests. In 1870, he praised the Ottoman Sultan Abdulaziz, describing him as «the defender of the Caliphate.» However, later, when the British policy towards the Turks began to develop in a hostile direction, his position also changed. For example, as a result of this, he did not recognize the Ottoman Sultan Sultan Abdulhamid II as the Caliph, and declared that the Caliphate period ended with the first four Caliphs, and that the Muslims of India would submit to the British government [Ahmad, 1967, 125]. However, Sayyid Ahmed Khan's close associate Shibli Numani took a different position on politics from Sayyid Ahmed Khan. He did not hesitate to criticize the British and actively supported the Ottomans and their Caliphate. In general, Indian modernists mainly supported secular and serious politics. However, the famous Jadidist Afghan Jamaluddin

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NMU
NUR·MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

163

№3 (07) 2025

Afghani (1837-1897), who lived for a while in India, was of the opinion that it was necessary to fight against Pan-Islamism and the colonial policies of the West [Kamal, 2018, 486].

Sayyid Ahmed Khan's visit to Great Britain in 1869 was one of the most significant events in his life. This journey, which he made with his sons Hamid and Mahmud, enriched him with new ideas and significantly influenced his worldview. Sayyid Ahmed Khan, who spent seventeen months there, mainly studied the structure and system of English universities. The deep impression he had on himself after returning to his country can be seen in his writing in January 1970: «If people do not seek the light of the Quran and reliable hadiths and do not carry religion and modern science together, then Islam will disappear in India» [Ahmad, 1961, 59]. That is, he believed in the power of Islam to lead people out of darkness and into civilization. Only Muslims need to correctly understand the two foundations of Islam and be able to apply them in their daily lives. Another project he undertook after returning from the trip was to start a magazine called Tahzu'ib-ul-Akhlaq (Enhancement of Morality). Through this magazine, he promoted modern science and his modernist views among Indian Muslims. In 1875, he founded the Mohammadan Anglo-Oriental College in Aligarh, a college that taught according to the Western system [Öz, 1989, 73]. In this way, he realized his greatest dream and plan to open a modern educational institution. Aligarh College became the main school and center of Indian modernists. Indian Muslims called the graduates of Aligarh College as well as those who followed in the footsteps of Sayyid Ahmed Khan «Aligarchists». The opening of Aligarh College was financially and ideologically supported by Lord Lytton (1831-1891), the British governor of India. Initially, some of the teachers of the college were famous orientalists of the time. For this, the institution was criticized by other Muslim scholars [Eren, 1989, 460].

As the main representative of the Indian Jadidists, if we touch on the religious ideas and conclusions of Sayyid Ahmed Khan, we can say that he was dissatisfied with the attitude of Muslims towards their religion. In this regard, he expresses his opinion as follows: «Islam is not a visible idol. The authority of Islam increases through the behavior and examples shown by Muslims. Muslims have tarnished the authority of Islam, and people have even hated it. I hope that Muslims will acquire good qualities, maintain good habits and common sense, correct their circumstances and develop their personalities. In this way, they will be able to show the world a pure image of Islam» [Muhammad Abdu, 2021, 105]. Sayyid Ahmed Khan proposed that for this purpose, new heights should be conquered, innovation should be sought, and action should be taken in line with the times. For example, he believed that a new approach should be taken towards Islamic teachings such as fiqh, aqeedah, kalam and tafsir and their foundations, and in this regard, India needs its own Martin Luther. In this regard, he first argued that Islamic thought needed to be reformed, which, in his opinion, could be achieved by returning to the foundations

164
№3 (07) 2025

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

of Islam and interpreting these foundations with reason. He rejected any world that contradicted reason, for which reason took precedence in various ways of acquiring knowledge. Religious faith remained in a certain secondary position. He refused to accept all the amazing things that were beyond reason, except for God. Instead, he called on Muslims to arm themselves with science-based knowledge and turn to the Western educational process. He also argued that since nature is a creation of God, trying to explain it scientifically does not contradict religious faith, and that the work of God (nature) and the word of God (the Quran) can never contradict each other [Kamal, 2018: 480]. He argued that there was no difference whether the words of God were conveyed to the Prophet Muhammad through the angel Gabriel or directly to him. Allah is omnipotent and has many attributes, but God has created natural laws that beings obey at His will. Therefore, there can be no ruling in the Quran that contradicts the laws of nature, and the eschatology, angelology, demonology, and cosmology of the Quran are not contrary to scientific thought [Ahmad, 1969, 13]. And in the journal Tahzib al-Akhlaq, his colleague Chirag Ali wrote that the Quran speaks of nature and natural laws, which in itself can serve as a basis for creating a theology of nature.

Sayyid Ahmed Khan considered religious and worldly affairs separately. He believed that religious matters were based on revelation and therefore did not change, while worldly matters were dynamic and constantly changing. However, in the Islamic world, worldly matters themselves were based on Sharia and elevated to the level of text, and this was primarily the responsibility of the scholars, whose views on the interpretation of Sharia over time became Sharia itself, and as a result, it was declared that the door to ijtihad was closed. However, with the passage of time, due to the changing and complex needs, the demand for ijtihad also increased, and for this reason, he believed that fiqh (Islamic law) should also be reviewed and studied, and the door to ijtihad should always be open [Özcan, 2004, 201].

Sayyid Ahmed Khan was probably most concerned about the issue of kalam (faith) in religious matters. He was dissatisfied with the kalam (religious doctrine) that had developed at that time. He argued that the methods developed by medieval theologians and Mu'tazilites against Greek philosophy could not respond to modern science, and therefore it was necessary to create a new theology. In his commentary book, Tahrir fi usul-t Tafsir (Correction of the Method of Tafsir), he outlined the foundations of modern theology. In his opinion, the new theology system should be based on the following three values: 1. Allah is the absolute creator and the act of creation continues to this day; 2. Allah's existence is found in reason; 3. There can be no contradiction between Allah's creation (nature) and Allah's word (the Quran) [Özcan, 2004, 200]. As we have already mentioned, the Indian Jadidists also had a critical attitude towards the hadiths of the Prophet Muhammad. In this regard, they were often concerned not with the concept of the hadith itself,

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NUR·MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

165
№3 (07) 2025

but with their text and the way they were transmitted, in other words, with their reliability. In this regard, they argued that it was impossible to verify whether the hadith texts were transmitted exactly as the Prophet Muhammad said them. In turn, Sayyid Ahmed Khan's view of the hadiths of the Prophet was also based on doubt. According to him, although experts examined the narrators who transmitted the hadith, they did not examine the transmitted texts themselves. However, not all Indian modernists shared the same opinion regarding the hadith tradition. For example, Maulana Khali, a student and biographer of Sayyid Ahmed Khan, did not reject all hadiths. He divided them into two categories: those related to the permanent rulings of the Quran and those related to the problems of the Prophet's Arab-Muslim society. He did not consider the second type of hadith to be obligatory for Muslims to follow [Kamal, 2018, 483]. In general, both Sayyid Ahmed Khan and his ideological partner Chirag Ali believed that before considering hadiths as a source on which to rely for solving legal issues, they should be subjected to scientific and rational filtering and verification. He also refused to accept Ijma' as a religious foundation [Ahmad, 1969, 13].

Regarding the issue of revelation, among modernists, revelations in the category of revelation and revelation were considered as the product of a certain ability of the mind, manifested in some individuals, such as prophets. And the fact that revelation is a direct knowledge given to man from God was denied. As a result of the rational understanding of religion, miracles (the miraculous things performed by prophets) were also denied, because they contradicted the laws of nature (Kamal, 2018, 480). In turn, Sayyid Ahmed Khan believed that miracles such as the parting of the sea by the Prophet Moses and the transformation of his staff into a snake, as well as religious concepts such as angels, devils and jinn, should be given rational reinterpretations. He believed that the Quran is perfect and therefore cannot be changed, but not all the issues it contains are directly related to religion. The Prophet Muhammad was also a human being, and his words and actions regarding worldly affairs should not be accepted at the level of the ruling of the sacred text. No one disputes the things written in religious texts about faith and worship, but the topics about public life are not sacred. The views of religious scholars on various political, social and economic issues have acquired a religious character during the transfer from one generation to another and have become sacred texts. In this way, he argued that religion has become stable [Özcan, 2004, 200].

After dividing the Quranic rulings into permanent and temporary, Indian modernists have classified issues such as polygamy (multiple wives), slavery, gender equality, human rights and riba (usury) as temporary rulings of the Quran and have tried to reconsider them. For example, Sayyid Ahmed Khan argued that polygamy is not permitted in his interpretation of the verses in the Quran. One of his students, Mumtaz Ali, sought to protect women's rights through education and founded the first Islamic journal on women's rights in

166
№3 (07) 2025

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

India, Tahzibul-ul-Niswan (Women's Development), under the auspices of her teacher's journal Tahzibul-ul-Akhlaq. The issue of slavery was also re-examined by the Jadidists, who dismissed it as a phenomenon incompatible with reason and the new era. They tried to justify this by arguing that the institution of slavery in Islam and the freedom of choice in man cannot coexist. They also argued that although man is free, it is illogical for him to be in slavery at the same time, and therefore the Quran cannot contain contradictory rulings [Kamal, 2018, 482].

One of Sayyid Ahmed Khan's closest associates, Chirag Ali (1840-1895), was largely interested in social and ethical issues. Chirag Ali's book Proposed Political, Legal, and Social Reforms in the Ottoman Empire and Other Mohammedan States, published in 1883, is one of the earliest works on religious modernism in India. He held more radical views on political and social issues than Sayyid Ahmed Khan. He argued that the Quran had both immutable and modifiable aspects. Chirag Ali, who denied the existence of a necessary connection between religion and social life, argued that the Prophet Muhammad's actions and words on social issues were irrelevant to religion. The thinker suggested that Muslims, because they did not understand their religion and could not keep up with the times, were lagging behind in socio-economic aspects, and that Muslim countries should not waste time and benefit from the results of modern science and the achievements of the West. For example, he supported the widespread implementation of banking and financial systems in Muslim countries. He concluded that the prohibition of usury in the Quran was a ruling that was made for the time of the Prophet and was limited to that time [Özcan, 2004, 203].

The issue of fate in Islam was not left out of the attention of the Indian Jadidists. This was a topic that had been the subject of many disputes between Mu'tazilites and theologians in the Middle Ages. In turn, the Muslim modernists of India categorically rejected the doctrine of fate. But they did not all unanimously, like the Mu'tazilites, claim that man has complete freedom of choice. A certain part of the modernists remained under the influence of scientific determinism, which became popular in the 19th century, in other words, the theory of understanding real life through causal relationships between events in nature and history. In general, the question of whether man has freedom of choice or whether everything is decided for him divided the modernists into three groups: some of them advocated scientific determinism, others rejected it and supported a lighter form of determinism that left man free to choose, and the rest, one can say, accepted the doctrine of complete freedom of choice [Kamal, 2018, 483]. Scientific determinists such as Sayyid Ahmed Khan, Maulana Khali, and Shibli Numani interpreted the universe (except for the idea of creation from nothing) on an onto-theological basis, following Aristotle's example. God is the creator, the First Cause of the universe and man, but because of the chain of cause and effect, God is not directly involved

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NMU NUR·MUBARAK UNIVERSITY

167
№3 (07) 2025

in individual life. Events in nature and history occur according to natural laws and are determined by natural causes. This interpretation has two meanings: first, God does not intervene in the lives of individuals and the course of history; second, events in the world do not occur according to a pre-ordained plan by fate or the Creator, but all this happens only through natural causes. Sayyid Ahmed Khan believed that certain verses in the Quran specifically indicate that the Creator is the First Cause and that all other causes exist only through the Creator. However, another section of modernists disagreed with this view. They argued that scientific determinism leaves no room for human freedom of choice. For example, another prominent Jadid Muslim scholar, Jamaluddin Afghani, tried to adopt a lighter form of determinism, like the Ashgaris, between fate and free will. In short, the Aligarh scholars, led by Sayyid Ahmed Khan, pursued a scientific determinism against the traditional scholars and aimed to free the minds of Muslims from the shackles of fate [Kamal, 2018, 484].

Shibli Numani, a prominent representative of Indian modernism in the second half of the 19th century, believed that just as Muslim scholars in the early era of Islam opposed Greek philosophy, modern theologians also had a duty to respond to modern atheism. In his opinion, religion is not only about faith and worship, and accordingly, theology should also include topics such as freedom, human rights, and the status of women [Özcan, 2004: 203]. Shibli Numani argued that it is necessary to benefit not only from the scholars who

lived in the earliest eras of Islam (the Age of Wisdom), but also from the works of all scholars in various fields throughout Muslim history. In addition, according to Shibli, Muslims tend to see their backwardness, laziness and failure as fate. The thinker actually disagrees with the above opinion, stating that Allah Almighty has given a certain level of freedom to the human being and that man is responsible for his actions [Özervarlı, 2010, 127].

Shibli also discusses the metaphysical issues in Islam and tries to logically justify their truth. In this verse, he gives the example of the phenomenon of dreams for atheists who do not believe in resurrection after death and the afterlife. No one can deny dreams. People can travel to different places in their dreams that they have never imagined. Similarly, he concludes that prophets and saints can also talk about the afterlife and the unseen world. He tries to explain the issue of punishment and reward in terms of cause and effect. Just as poison kills and medicine cures in the material world, so it is in the unseen world. It is impossible for the soul to remain unaffected by good and bad deeds. He writes that the joy that the soul experiences as a result of good deeds and the hardship that it experiences as a result of bad deeds are called reward and punishment in religion. Shibli argues that Islam was originally a simple and transparent religion, but over time, later generations added various things to it and made it more complicated, and the science of kalam became the core of the problems in the religion. Shibli believes that even the early Muslims would not

168

№3 (07) 2025

NYU
NUR-MUBARAK
UNIVERSITY

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

have been able to understand Islam, which was so entangled in such a tangle. According to the thinker, although ijtihad was encouraged since the time of the Companions, later imitation dominated the religion. Although it is stated in the books of kalam that «Imitation is not allowed in faith», this phrase lost its meaning in later times [Özervarlı, 2010, 128].

In 1894, the Council of Ulama (Nadwatul Ulama) was established in Lucknow on the initiative of Shibli Numani and a group of scholars. This council was seen as an organization that took a middle path between the extreme secularism of Aligarh and the extreme conservatism of the Deobandi and planned to unite Muslim scholars of different views in India. On the basis of this council, the foundation of the Darul Uloom Nadwatul Ulama religious institution was laid in 1898.

The Aligarhites viewed the establishment of the Ulama Council positively. Realizing that group collectivism was more necessary than individual initiatives in religious education, they supported the need for a council that would bring together different views. In general, modernists themselves later realized the dangers of studying modern teachings in depth, and therefore believed that it was necessary to maintain a balance with religious knowledge. Otherwise, the youth, fed up with the purely rational science of the West, could fall into pessimistic skepticism, apostasy and atheism.

Shibli Numani, who had been actively involved in the work of the Ulama Council since 1904, came under the influence of Pan-Islamism in 1908 and opposed the Aligarhites. The Ulama Council, which was initially planned as a moderate organization, gradually moved away from the modernism of Aligarh and towards religious conservatism. Thus, over time, the council became no different from the Deoband school. In 1920, the members of the Ulama Council agreed to adopt a position that rejected, in particular, the rationalism of Sayyid Ahmed Khan and the Aligarh modernists [Ahmad, 1967, 112].

Conclusion

In the second half of the 19th century, we saw the rise of Islamic modernism in the Indian subcontinent. Innovative ideas and revolutionary views were expressed regarding Islam. The ideas of Jadidism and religious innovation also spread to other countries of the Islamic world, such as Crimea, Egypt, and the Levant. However, Jadidism in India stands out for its exceptional ideological boldness and acquired a unique character. There are several reasons for this. First, Indian Muslims were among the first among the Ummah to become acquainted with the most advanced Western civilization of that time. The British had been present in India since the 16th century through the East India Company. Then came the policy of colonization, Western-style colleges began to open, a new culture was established, etc. Thus, Indians absorbed and became acquainted with the fruits of modernity from an early age. The British, who were called the «masters of the seas», brought them rationality, systematic thinking, and coolness. It can be said that this had a

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

NUR·MUBARAK UNIVERSITY

169
№3 (07) 2025

significant impact on the nature of future religious modernism. Secondly, after the unsuccessful uprising of the Indian people against the British in 1857, the political situation in the country deteriorated significantly. India officially came under the rule of the British Empire, and British rule was consolidated. The Indian nation, which had been ruled by the descendants of Babur for centuries, was besieged by a huge Christian state. Muslims lost their centuries–old political and social dominance. On the one hand, Christian missionaries and on the other, Hindu religious leaders oppressed Muslims. At this point, the Muslim minority needed new religious ideas and an educational system so that they would not be swallowed up between the majority of Indians and Western Christianity/secularism.

During this period, it can be seen that the religious revival in India developed mainly in several directions. Religious modernists, traditionalist Deobandi and fundamentalist Hadith scholars. Modernist scholars did not oppose British rule, but actively supported it and sought to benefit from British knowledge and science. Muslim intellectuals believed that Muslims should either prove that modern science was incompatible with Islam or that Islam was not incompatible with it. In other words, if modern science could not be proven to be incompatible with Islam, they believed that it was best to accept it. However, the religious ideas of the progressive Jadidists led by Sayyid Ahmed Khan were not accepted by the Muslim elite in India, and even their entire ideas were rejected. Perhaps their ideas were too radical, or perhaps Indian Muslims at that time were not yet ready to accept revolutionary ideas in the religious sphere. In any case, it is worth noting that ideas such as reinterpreting the structure of the Prophet's Sunnah and describing miracles as metaphors are views that are shocking to the Muslim community of today, let alone the Muslims of the 19th century.

Islamic modernism, as a reformist movement, aimed to interpret the dogmas of religion in the light of reason and to change the religious views that had been formed by medieval scholars but had now become entrenched. It aimed to bring Western science and to equalize the window of the Muslim world with the modern era. But Islamic modernism did not spread widely. It could not go beyond the level of a topic of discussion among Muslim intellectuals and academic circles. Nevertheless, the views of the Indian modernists of the 19th century had a great influence on the later generation of Pakistani thinkers, such as Muhammad Iqbal and Fazlur Rahman, who left a special mark on the intellectual history of Islam.

References

1. Ahmad, A. (1961). Sayyid Ahmad Khan, Jamal al-Din Al-Afghani and Muslim India. *Studia Islamica, 13*, 59.

2. Ahmad, A. (1967). *Islamic modernism in India and Pakistan 1857-1964* (p. 24). London-Bombay-Karachi: Oxford University Press.

3. Ahmad, A. (1969). *An intellectual history of Islam in India* (p. 13). Edinburgh.

170
№3 (07) 2025

ИСЛАМТАНУ ЗЕРТТЕУЛЕРІ Ғылыми журнал
RESEARCH IN ISLAMIC STUDIES Scientific journal
بحوث في الدراسات الإسلامية مجلة علمية

4. Özcan, A. (2004). Hindistan'da 19. yüzyıl İslam modernizmi ve Seyyid Ahmed Han [19th century Islamic modernism in India and Sayyid Ahmed Khan]. *İslamiyet üç aylık araştırma dergisi, 7*(4), 197.

5. Britannica. (2024, January 1). Shāh Walī Allāh. *Encyclopedia Britannica*. https://www.britannica.com/biography/Shah–Wali–Allah

6. Özkan, H. (2003). Bağımsızlık mücadelesinde yenilikçi bir ruh; Sir Seyyid Ahmed Han ve Aligarh hareketi [An innovative spirit in the struggle for independence; Sir Sayyid Ahmed Khan and the Aligarh movement]. *Nüsha dergisi, 3*(8), 150.

7. Eren, H. (1989). Aligarh [Aligarh]. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (Vol. 2, p. 460). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi. [In Turkish]

8. Muhammad Abdu, H. (2021). Dauur as-Sayyit Ahmad Han fi Islahi at-Tafkır ad-Dini fi-l Islam al-Mughasır [Role of Sayyid Ahmed Khan in reviving contemporary religious thought of Islam]. *Kafkas Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, 15*(8), 105.

9. Kamal, M. (2018). Islamic modernism in India. In *Routledge history of world philosophies* (p. 480). New York: Routledge.

10. Öz, M. (1989). Ahmed Han, Seyyid [Sayyid Ahmed Khan]. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (Vol. 2, p. 74). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi.

11. M. S. (2010). Şibli Numani fikirleri [Shibli Numani's thoughts]. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (p. 127). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi.

12. *Speeches and addresses relating to the Mahomedan Anglo-Oriental College in Aligarh.* (1898). Aligarh: Institute Press. (Address presented to the Viceroy, Lord Lytton), p. 24.

13. Khan, S. A. (n.d.). *Review on Dr. Hunter's Indian Musulmans* (pp. 38–40). Lahore.

Әдебиеттер

1. Ahmad, A. (1961). Sayyid Ahmad Khan, Jamal al-Din al-Afghani and Muslim India. *Studia Islamica, 13*, 59.

2. Ahmad, A. (1967). *Islamic modernism in India and Pakistan 1857-1964* (p. 24). London-Bombay-Karachi: Oxford University Press.

3. Ahmad, A. (1969). *An intellectual history of Islam in India* (p. 13). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

4. Özcan, A. (2004). Hindistan'da 19. yüzyıl İslam modernizmi ve Seyyid Ahmed Han. *İslamiyet: Üç aylık araştırma dergisi, 7*(4), 197.

5. Britannica, The Editors of Encyclopaedia. (2024, January 1). Shāh Walī Allāh. In *Encyclopedia Britannica*. https://www.britannica.com/biography/Shah–Wali–Allah

6. Eren, H. (1989). Aligarh. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (Vol. 2, p. 460). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi.

7. Özkan, H. (2003). Bağımsızlık mücadelesinde yenilikçi bir ruh; Sir Seyyid Ahmed Han ve Aligarh hareketi. *Nüsha, 3*(8), 150.

8. Мұхаммед Абду, А. Дауыр әс-Сәйіт Ахмад Хан фи Ислахи әт-Тәфкир әд-Дини фи-л Ислам әл-Мұғасир. – Kafkas Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, 15 (8). 2021. – s. 105

9. Khan, S. A. (n.d.). *Review on Dr Hunter's Indian Musulmans* (pp. 38-40). Lahore.

10. Kamal, M. (2018). Islamic modernism in India. In *Routledge History of World Philosophies* (p. 480). New York: Routledge.

11. Öz, M. (1989). Ahmed Han, Seyyid. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (Vol. 2, p. 74). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi.

12. Özervarlı, M. S. (2010). Şibli Numani fikirleri. In *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (p. 127). TDV İslam Araştırma Merkezi.

13. *Speeches and addresses relating to the Mahomedan Anglo-Oriental College in Aligarh.* (1898). (Address presented to the Viceroy, Lord Lytton). Aligarh: Institute Press.

***

Авторлар туралы мәлімет:

Абдилхаким Бурханадин Шарафутдинұлы – PhD, Нұр-Мүбарак Египет ислам мәдениеті университеті Дінтану кафедрасының аға оқытушысы (Алматы, Қазақстан, e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8271-866X)

معلومات عن المؤلفين:

عبد الحكيم بورخنادين شرف الدين – دكتوراه، محاضر أول في قسم علم الأديان بجامعة نور مبارك المصرية للثقافة الإسلامية (ألماطي، كازاخستان).

Information about authors:

Abdilkhakim, Burkhanadin Sharafutdinuly – PhD, Senior Lecturer at the Department of Religious Studies, Nur-Mubarak Egyptian University of Islamic Culture (Almaty, Kazakhstan, e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8271-866X)

Информация об авторах:

Абдилхаким, Бурханадин Шарафутдинұлы – PhD, старший преподаватель кафедры религиоведения Египетского университета исламской культуры Нур-Мубарак (Алматы, Казахстан, e-mail: burhanhakim01@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8271-866X)